



REF UPDATE #7 – 8 AUGUST 2011

REF UPDATE is a series of papers which seek to inform colleagues about the Research Excellence Framework, in respect of external activities to develop the process and methodology, and of internal activities to collect information and prepare for submission to the REF. REF UPDATE is archived on the UEL REF web pages at www.uel.ac.uk/ref

The Rules of Engagement #2 – Panel Criteria and Working Methods

Introduction

Following on from their publication of the generic *Assessment Framework and Guidance on Submissions* document for REF (reported on in *REF Update #6*), HEFCE have now published sets of criteria for the four Main Panels for REF. These are in draft form for consultation within the sector, for a closing date of 5 October 2011. Final versions will be published in early 2012.

This edition of *REF Update* is intended to fill in some of the blanks noted in *REF Update #6*, provides UoA subject descriptors, highlights differences in the treatment of certain aspects of the data requirements and methodologies between different panels, and brings together the panels' lists of impact indicators.

Please note that within some Main Panels, there are occasional differences between the sub-panels. This paper concentrates on those which have already been identified as possible targets for UEL submissions (for which UoA descriptors are given below). This does not mean, as we continue our preparations, that we will not consider additional UoAs, but the information captured here would need to be updated for them. Similarly some matters that are not thought applicable to UEL have not been reported.

Treatment of ECRs and other personal circumstances

Early Career Researchers (that is, staff starting their careers as independent researchers on or after 1 August 2009) are permitted to reduce the number of outputs submitted to three if they took up their first post between 1 August 2009 and 31 July 2010; to two if they took up their first post between 1 August 2010 and 31 July 2011, and to one if they took up their first post after 1 August 2011.

Other personal circumstances which can be clearly defined – in effect, equated to a period of absence – also merit a reduction in the number of outputs required. Staff who have been absent for up to 13.99 months, or who have held an average FTE over the REF period of 0.801 or more, are not entitled to any reduction. Staff absent for between 14 and 27.99 months, or have held an average FTE over the REF period of between 0.601 and 0.8, need only submit three outputs. Staff absent for 28.99 to 48 months, or FTE of 0.301 to 0.6, may submit two outputs. Staff absent for 49 months or more, or on an average FTE of 0.3 or below, need only submit one output.

Combination of circumstances (e.g. ECR and part-time working) is permissible. A judgement call will have to be made by the University in respect of complex personal circumstances and a reasonable reduction in the number of outputs required. Complex circumstances will be considered by a special REF panel at HEFCE to provide consistency across the exercise.

Unit of Assessment descriptors relevant to UEL

UoA 2 Public Health, Health Services and Primary Care includes research that is focused on public health, health services and/or primary care. The research may be applied, theoretical or methodological research from any relevant health or healthcare discipline. The sub-panel expects submissions in this UOA from all areas of public health and epidemiology (from aetiology to intervention), health services and primary care including clinical trials, health social sciences, health policy research and health care management, and from other related disciplines having a relevance to the research covered by the UOA. It recognises the breadth and diverse range of single, multidisciplinary and/or multi-professional research across public health, health services and primary care

UoA 3 Allied Health Professions, Dentistry, Nursing and Pharmacy includes research in biomedical and nutritional sciences, vision sciences; optometry (including orthoptics), diagnostic imaging, therapeutic radiography, audiology, podiatry, occupational therapy, physiotherapy, speech and language therapy, clinical linguistics, paramedics, prosthetics/orthotics, music therapy, drama therapy, and arts therapy. For dentistry it includes research in basic and applied dental, oral and craniofacial sciences encompassing all the related clinical disciplines, primary dental care, biomaterials sciences relevant to oral and craniofacial science and other such sciences relevant to dentistry. For nursing and midwifery it includes specialist community and public health nursing, and all the contexts within which they operate. For pharmacy it includes all aspects of the design, synthesis, formulation, action and use of pharmaceuticals (including biological and neutraceuticals), to include medicinal chemistry, pharmaceuticals, pharmacology, clinical pharmacy, and the practice of pharmacy. The UOA also includes research into the clinical and public health practices, health services, health policies, education and underpinning science relevant to these disciplines and psychosocial, philosophical and ethical aspects of health care and health promotion.

UoA 4 Psychology, Neuroscience and Psychiatry For psychology the sub-panel expects submissions in this UOA covering the full range of the discipline, from all areas of applied psychology to basic human and non-human animal research, computational modelling and cognitive neuroscience. For neuroscience the sub-panel expects submissions in this UOA to span topics from the molecular through to whole system behavioural research, genetics and varieties of imaging, incorporating neurodevelopmental as well as adult work. It will include work on the understanding and treatment all types of brain injury, stroke, neurodegenerative and neurodevelopmental disorders.



For psychiatry this will include all areas of the discipline, including biological, community, developmental, genetic, and neuropharmacological research.

UoA 11 Computer Science and Informatics includes the study of methods for acquiring, storing, processing, communicating and reasoning about information, and interactivity in natural and artificial systems, through the implementation, organisation and use of computer hardware, software and other resources. The subjects are characterised by the rigorous application of analysis, experimentation and design.

UoA 15 General Engineering includes multidisciplinary and interdisciplinary engineering research in fields such as medical engineering, bioengineering, environmental engineering, offshore technology, renewable energy/energy conversion, spacecraft engineering, control systems engineering and industrial studies. The UOA also includes mineral and mining engineering and pedagogic research in engineering. The sub-panel also welcomes submissions from single organisational units within institutions that include activities spanning two or more of the other three UOAs in the fields of engineering: UOA 12 (Aeronautical, Mechanical, Chemical and Manufacturing Engineering), UOA 13 (Electrical and Electronic Engineering, Metallurgy and Materials), and UOA 14 (Civil and Construction Engineering).

UoA 16 Architecture, Built Environment and Planning covers all forms of theoretical, applied and practice-based research relevant to architecture, the built environment and planning, and their history, both in the UK and internationally. This includes: building engineering, building science, communities, construction economic development, environment, housing, landscape, real estate, regeneration, sustainability, transport, urban and regional analysis, urban design, and urbanism. The UOA also covers any other research in which the built environment (including its operation and use) forms a major field for application or provides the context for research.

UoA 19 Business and Management Studies consists of the areas of: accounting and finance; business history; business and industrial economics; corporate governance and risk management; corporate social responsibility; employment relations; entrepreneurship and small firms; human resource management; information management and business systems; innovation and technology management; international business; management education and development; management science; marketing; operations and project management; organisational psychology; organisational studies; public sector management; public services and third sector; service management; strategic management; and any other field or sub-field aligned to business and management.



UoA 20 Law includes all doctrinal, theoretical, empirical, comparative, critical or other studies of law and legal phenomena including criminology and socio-legal studies.

UoA 22 Social Work and Social Policy covers all forms of research in social work, social policy and administration and criminology, including those in governmental, voluntary and community, and private for profit and not for profit areas. Research includes - theory, methodology, empirical research, ethics and values and pedagogy as they apply to social work, social care, social policy, criminology and criminal justice policy, gerontology and substantive issues in these areas of study; comparative research and research into international institutions, policy and practice; research that uses a range of disciplinary approaches including (but not exclusively) the following: business and management, demography, development studies, economics, education, geography, health studies, history, law, politics, psychology and sociology; relevant links with other stakeholders, professionals, service users and carers; policy-making processes, practice, governance and management, service design, delivery and use, and inter-professional relationships.

UoA 23 Sociology includes empirical and theoretical study of the social structures, cultures and everyday practices of societies, including styles and material standards of living, opinions, values and institutions. It covers all areas of social theory, historical and comparative studies, and social research methodology (including qualitative and quantitative methods and visual methodologies), philosophy of social science, and research on pedagogy in sociology. The sub-panel expects submissions in this UOA from all fields of sociological enquiry including, but not restricted to, research on cultures, economies, and politics; class, ethnicity, gender, sexuality, disability, and age; religion, education, health and medicine, family, media, welfare institutions, and work and employment; environment, technology, and climate change; the body, interpersonal and inter-group relations, violence; urban and rural issues; language and social interaction; political sociology, public policy, and social movements; political economy, globalisation, development, migration, and diaspora; comparative studies of societies of all kinds, including work on transnational structures and agencies, the European Union, world systems. The sub-panel welcomes works in social theory and the history of social thought. The sub-panel will also consider research on the sociological aspects of interdisciplinary fields such as demography, criminology, socio-legal studies, socio-linguistics, socio-psychology, psychosocial studies, media and cultural studies, and social studies of science and technology, including science and technology policy. The sub-panel welcomes work in interdisciplinary women's studies and work in such areas as lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex studies.

UoA 25 Education may be broadly described as being concerned with research in the areas identified in the following illustrative lists:

- Research which addresses education systems, issues, processes, provision and outcomes in relation to sectors **such as**: early years, primary, secondary, further, higher, medical, workplace, adult and continuing education. It also includes teacher, healthcare and other forms of professional education, vocational training; and informal, community and lifelong learning.
- Research which addresses substantive areas **such as**: curriculum, pedagogy, assessment, teaching and learning; children, young people, student and adult learners; parents, families and communities; culture, economy and society; teacher training, professionalism and continuing professional development; special and inclusive education; participation, rights and equity issues; technology enhanced learning; education policy; the organisation, governance, management, effectiveness and improvement of educational institutions; education, training, workplaces, industry and the labour market; comparative, international and development education.
- Research which employs a range of theoretical frameworks and methodologies drawn from disciplinary traditions **including, but not limited to**: anthropology, applied linguistics, economics, geography, history, humanities, mathematics, statistics, philosophy, psychology, science and sociology. Research in the field of education deploys a range of qualitative and quantitative methodologies with structured, exploratory and participatory research designs. These **include, but are not limited to**: surveys, experiments and controlled trials; ethnography, interview and narrative enquiry; action research and case study; evaluation research; critical theory and documentary analysis; analytic synthesis and systematic review.

UoA 34 Art and Design: History, Practice and Theory includes research from all aspects of the history, theory and practice of art and design. **Practice** encompasses all disciplines within art and design, in which methods of making, representation, interrogation and interpretation are integral to their productions. **History** and **Theory** encompass the history, criticism, theory, historiography, pedagogy and aesthetics of architecture, art, craft, and design in their widest chronological and geographical framework. The UOA may also embrace fields such as anthropology, archaeology, cultural, social and gender studies, entrepreneurship, innovation, management and business studies, media studies, museology, and urban planning, where these relate to visual, material and spatial cultures. The following is an illustrative list of subject areas within practice, theory and history that the sub-panel expects to assess: applied and decorative arts; architecture; conservation and technical art history; crafts; creative and heritage industries; entrepreneurship and enterprise; critical, historical, social and cultural studies; fine arts; landscape and garden design; museology and curatorship; policy, management and



innovation studies; photography; product design; spatial, two- and three-dimensional design; textile, dress and fashion; time-based and digital media; visual and material culture.

UoA 35 Music, Drama, Dance and Performing Arts includes research from all areas of music, drama, dance, theatre, performance, live art, film and television studies, and the sub-panel anticipates that outputs will span a range of writings, research-led practices and practice-based media, as well as artefacts. The sub-panel expects to evaluate research that encompasses analytical, applied, ethnographical, historical, interdisciplinary, pedagogical, practice-led, scientific, technological and theoretical approaches to the widest domains of dance, drama, music, performing and screen arts, and covers the broadest understanding of the subject disciplines within any cultural, geographical or historical context.

UOA 36: Communication, Cultural and Media Studies, Library and Information Management includes research that addresses or deploys theory, history, institutional, policy, textual, critical and/or empirical analysis, or practice within communication, culture, media, journalism and film studies. Within UK higher education much, but not all, of this work is likely to emanate from units or departments in communication studies, cultural studies, media studies, journalism, or film and television studies. This work will include research on print media, broadcasting and the moving image, and will include computer-mediated communication, popular culture, and diverse information and communication technologies, which will be variably titled and organised. Much will also be conducted in units or departments situated elsewhere within the social sciences, arts or humanities. The sub-panel will assess research as defined above which addresses (but is not confined to): policy for regulation of culture and the media; the organisation, institutions, political economy and practice of cultural production; media and cultural texts, forms and practices; and media and cultural audiences, consumption and reception, including questions of power, identity and difference. The UOA also includes research concerned with the management of information and knowledge in all formats, namely librarianship and information science, archives and records management, and information systems. This may include: research on the generation, dissemination and publication, exploitation and evaluation of information and knowledge; information policy; information media; information literacy; systems thinking; systems development; knowledge management systems; information retrieval; preservation and conservation; impact assessment; digital humanities; and historical and cultural aspects of the disciplines.

Comparison of Data Requirements/Differences

Main Panels/Relevant UEL UoAs:	Main Panel A	Main Panel B	Main Panel C	Main Panel D
	2, 3, 4	11, 15	16, 19, 20, 22, 23, 25	34, 35, 36
Panel definitions of originality, significance and rigour given?	N	Y (33-35)	Y (38)	Y (50)
Panel defines quality levels?	N	Y (36)	Y (39)	Y (51)
Statement defining author contribution required?	Y – 50 words (37)	N – though may be audited (41-42)	Y – where submitted more than once in the same submission. 100 words. (51-53)	Y – 100 words (61)
Multiple submission of same outputs permitted in same submission?	Y – exceptionally. 50 word justification required (39-40)	N (43-44)	Y – if preferable to different outputs; never more than twice in the same submission (52)	Y (60)
Double-weighted outputs: justifying statement required?	Y – 50 words (43)	Y – 100 words (47)	Y – 100 words (58)	Y – 100 words (64)
Double-weighted outputs: reserves allowed?	N (42-46)	N (49)	N (58)	Y (67)
Additional information required for certain output types e.g. practice-based/non-text?	Y – 50 words (47-48)	Y – 300 words (51-52)	Y – 300 words (47-48)	Y – 300 words and/or portfolio (56b)
Additional information on significance required if not internally apparent?	N (48)	Y – 100 words (53-56)	Y – 100 words (62)	N (56d)
Information on outputs where a substantial part was published before 1 January 2008?	Y – 50 words (48-49)	Y – 300 words (57-59)	Y – no word limit given (43-35)	Y – no word limit given (58)
Citation data to be used?	Y – citation count (50-52)	Y – UoA 11 – citation count and Google Scholar. N – UoA 15 (60-64)	N (67-68)	N (72)
Individual testimonials acceptable as evidence of impact?	N (63)	Y (at least, not excluded) (76-78)	Y (at least, not included) (85-89)	Y (79)
Researchers required to be identified by research group?	Y (78)	N (but is allowed) (88a)	N (but is allowed) (110a)	N (but is allowed) (95-97)
Research Environment – additional metrics data required in REF5?	N (80)	Y – UoA 11 – FTE RAs, FTE PGRs. N – UoA 15. (90-91)	Y – UoAs 19 & 25, disaggregate PhD and Prof Doc completions (111-116)	N – (99)

Bracketed numbers (e.g. (23)) refer to the relevant paragraph of the appropriate Main Panel criteria and working methods document



Definitions and Examples of Impact

Main Panels A and B both produced detailed lists giving both overarching definitions (below in normal text) and specific examples of impact (below in *italics*) under a number of headers, shown in the table below. They did not use uniform headers – for example, Main Panel A made a distinction between Economic and Commercial impacts, which was not made by Main Panel B.

Main Panel A (UEL UoAs 2, 3, 4)	Main Panel B UEL (UoAs 11, 15)	
ECONOMIC IMPACTS		
Impacts where the beneficiaries are usually the NHS or private health care	Impacts where the beneficiaries may include businesses, either new or established, or other types of organisation which undertake activity that may create wealth	
<i>Policies that have an impact on economic growth or incentivising productive activity</i>		
<i>The costs of treatment or healthcare have been reduced</i>		
<i>Changing the roles and/or incentives for health professionals and organisations, resulting in improved service delivery</i>		
COMMERCIAL IMPACTS		
Impacts where the beneficiaries are usually companies, either new or established, or other types of organisation which undertake activity that increases wealth		
<i>A spin-out or new business has been created and established its viability by generating revenue or profits</i>	<i>A spin-out or new business has been created, established its viability, or generated revenue or profits</i>	
<i>Industry (including overseas industry) has invested in research and development</i>	<i>Industry (including overseas industry) or other organisations or charitable foundations have invested in their own research and development.</i>	
<i>The performance of an existing business has been improved</i>	<i>The performance of an existing business has been improved, through the introduction of new, or the improvement of existing, products, processes or services; the adoption of new, updated or enhanced technical standards and/or protocols, or the enhancement of strategy, operations or management practices.</i>	
<i>A business or sector has adopted a new technology or process</i>		
<i>The strategy, operations or management practices of a business have changed</i>		
<i>A new product or service is in production or has been commercialised</i>	<i>Performance has been improved, or new and changed technologies or processes adopted, in companies or other organisations through highly skilled people having taken up specialist roles that draws [sic] on their research, or through the provision of consultancy or training that draws on their research.</i>	
<i>Highly skilled people have taken up specialist roles (including academic consultancy) in companies or other organisations</i>		
<i>Jobs have been created or protected</i>		
<i>Social enterprise initiatives have been created</i>		
	<i>A new business sector or activity has been created</i>	



	<i>A new business or sector has adopted a new or significantly changed technology or process, including through acquisition and/or joint venture</i>
IMPACTS ON PUBLIC POLICY AND SERVICES	
Impacts where the beneficiaries are usually government, public sector, and charity organisations and societies, either as a whole or groups of individuals in society, through the implementation of policies	Impacts where the beneficiaries may include government, non-governmental organisations (NGOs), charities and public sector organisations and society, either as a whole or groups of individuals in society.
<i>Policy debate has been stimulated or informed by research evidence</i>	<i>Policy debate has been stimulated or informed by research evidence</i>
<i>Policy decisions or changes to legislation, regulations or guidelines have been informed by research evidence</i>	<i>Policy decisions or changes to legislation, regulations or guidelines have been informed by research evidence</i>
<i>The implementation of a policy or the delivery of a public service has changed</i>	<i>A policy has been realised (including those realised through changes to legislation) or the delivery of a public service has changed.</i>
<i>A new technology or process has been adopted</i>	<i>In delivering a public service, a new technology or process has been adopted or an existing technology or process improved</i>
<i>The quality or cost-effectiveness of a public service has been improved</i>	
<i>The public have benefitted from public service improvements</i>	<i>(Sections of) the public have benefitted from public service improvements</i>
<i>Control measures for infections have improved</i>	
	<i>Changes to education or the school curriculum have been informed by research</i>
	<i>Risks to national security have been reduced</i>
	<i>International development has been informed by research</i>
IMPACTS ON SOCIETY, CULTURE AND CREATIVITY	
Impacts where the beneficiaries are individuals, groups of individuals, organisations or communities whose knowledge, behaviours or practices have been influenced	Impacts where the beneficiaries may include individuals, groups of individuals, organisations or communities whose knowledge, behaviours, creative practices and other activity have been influenced
	<i>Public interest and engagement with science and engineering has been stimulated, including through the enhancement of science and engineering-related education in schools</i>
<i>Public understanding has improved through their collaborative involvement with research</i>	<i>The awareness, attitudes or understanding of (sections of) the public have been informed by engaging them with research of social or cultural significance</i>
<i>Public debate has been stimulated or informed by research</i>	<i>Public debate has been stimulated or informed by research</i>
<i>Changes to social policy have led to improved social welfare, equality or social inclusion</i>	



	<i>The work of an NGO, charitable or other organisation, including international agencies or institutions, has been influenced by the research</i>
	<i>Research has contributed to community regeneration</i>
HEALTH AND WELFARE IMPACTS / HEALTH IMPACTS	
Impacts where the beneficiaries are individuals and groups (both human and animals) whose quality of life has been enhanced (or potential harm mitigated)	Impacts where the beneficiaries may include individuals (including groups of individuals) whose health outcomes have been improved or whose quality of life has been enhanced (or potential harm mitigated) through the application of enhanced healthcare for individuals or public health activities.
<i>Public health and wellbeing has improved</i>	
<i>A new clinical or lifestyle intervention (for example, drug, diet, treatment or therapy) has been developed, trialled with patients, related or other groups (for example, prisoners, community samples) and definitive (positive or negative) outcomes demonstrated</i>	<i>A new drug, treatment or therapy, diagnostic or medical technology has been developed, trialled with patients, or adopted.</i>
<i>A new diagnostic or clinical technology has been adopted</i>	
<i>Disease prevention or markers of health have been enhanced by research</i>	
<i>Changes to care practices</i>	
<i>Improvements to outcomes for patients or related groups</i>	<i>Patient health outcomes have improved through, for example, the availability of a new drug, treatment or therapy, diagnostic or medical technology, changes to patient care practices, or changes to clinical or healthcare guidelines.</i>
<i>Clinical, dietary or healthcare guidelines have changed</i>	
<i>Healthcare training guidelines have changed</i>	
<i>Decisions by a health service or regulatory authority have been informed by research</i>	<i>Decisions by a health service or regulatory authority have been informed by research</i>
<i>Public awareness of a health risk or benefit has been raised</i>	<i>Public health and quality of life has been enhanced through, for example, enhanced public awareness of a health risk, enhanced disease prevention or, in developing countries, improved water quality or access to healthcare</i>
<i>Public behaviour has changed</i>	
<i>The user experience has improved</i>	
<i>Animal health and welfare has been enhanced by research</i>	
<i>The control of zoonotic diseases has changed</i>	
	<i>The costs of treatment or healthcare have been reduced</i>
	<i>Quality of life in a developed or developing country has been improved by new products or processes</i>



PRODUCTION IMPACTS	
Impacts where the beneficiaries are individuals (including groups of individuals) whose production has been enhanced	
<i>Research has increased production, yields or quality or reduced waste</i>	
<i>Decisions by regulatory authorities have been influenced by research</i>	
<i>Costs of production have been reduced</i>	
<i>Husbandry methods have changed</i>	
<i>Change in management practices in production businesses</i>	
IMPACTS ON PRACTITIONERS AND PUBLIC SERVICES	
Impacts where beneficiaries are organisations or individuals, including service users involved in the development and delivery of professional services	Impacts where beneficiaries may include organisations or individuals involved in the development of and delivery of professional services
<i>Changes to professional standards, guidelines or training have been influenced by research</i>	<i>Changes to professional standards, guidelines or training have been informed by research</i>
<i>Practitioners/professionals have used research findings in conducting their work</i>	<i>Practitioners/professionals/lawyers have used research findings in the conduct of their work</i>
<i>The quality or efficiency of a professional service has improved</i>	<i>The quality or efficiency or productivity of a professional service has improved</i>
	<i>Professional bodies and learned societies have used research to define best practice</i>
	<i>Practices have changed, or new and improved processes have been adopted, in companies or other organisations, through the provision of training or consultancy</i>
<i>Work force planning has been influenced by research</i>	
<i>Forensic methods have been influenced by research</i>	<i>Forensic methods have been informed by research</i>
IMPACTS ON THE ENVIRONMENT	
Impacts where the key beneficiary is the natural or built environment	Impacts where the key beneficiaries are the natural environment and/or the built environment, together with societies, individuals and groups of individuals who benefit as a result
	<i>The environment has been improved through the introduction of new product(s), process(es) or service(s); the improvement of existing product(s), process(es) or services; or the enhancement of strategy, operations or management practices.</i>
<i>Policy debate on climate change or the environment has been influenced by research</i>	<i>Policy debate on the environment, environmental policy decisions or planning decisions have been stimulated or informed by research and research evidence</i>
<i>Environmental policy decisions have been influenced by research evidence</i>	
<i>Planning decisions have been informed by research</i>	



<i>The management or conservation of natural resources has changed</i>	<i>The management or conservation of natural resources, including issues around global competition for energy, water and food resources, has been influenced or changed.</i>
<i>The management of an environmental risk or hazard has changed</i>	<i>The management of an environmental risk or hazard has been changed.</i>
	<i>The operations of a business or public service have been changed to achieve environmental (green) objectives</i>
	<i>Direct intervention, based on research evidence, has led to reduction in carbon dioxide or other environmentally damaging emissions</i>
IMPACTS ON INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT	
Impacts where the beneficiaries are international bodies, countries, governments or communities	
<i>International policy developments have been influenced by research</i>	
<i>International agencies or institutions have been influenced by research</i>	
<i>Quality of life in a developing country has improved</i>	

Main Panel C (covering, for UEL, UoAs 16, 19, 20, 22, 23 and 25) decided that “providing HEIs with detailed lists of impacts and evidence and/or indicators for those impacts could appear prescriptive or limiting. It wishes to encourage the submission (across the REF as a whole) of a wide range of types of change, benefit or effect outside academia, as evidence of the impact of research from Main Panel C disciplines.” It produced broad definitions of impact under different headers, captured below. Main Panel D (covering, for UEL, UoAs 34, 35 and 36) did something similar, though using different headers, and also producing some examples. The division of these examples under the headers is entirely mine. Main Panel D will publish fuller lists of impact examples online in due course.

Main Panel C (UEL UoAs 16, 19, 20, 22, 23 and 25)	Main Panel D (UEL UoAs 34, 35 and 36)
SOCIETY	CIVIL SOCIETY
For example, impacts, benefits or effects on groups of individuals, whether organised or otherwise	Influencing the form and content of associations between people or groups to illuminate and challenge cultural values and social assumptions
	<i>Helping professionals and organisations adapt to changing cultural values</i>
	<i>Contributing to processes of commemoration, memorialisation and reconciliation</i>
	<i>Contributing to a wider public understanding of basic standards of wellbeing and human rights conceptions</i>



CULTURE	CULTURAL LIFE
<p>For example, impacts, benefits or effects on shared beliefs, values, understanding, or on artistic and social pursuits</p>	<p>Creating and interpreting cultural capital in all of its forms to enrich and expand the lives, imaginations and sensibilities of individuals and groups.</p>
	<p><i>Generating new ways of thinking that influence creative practice beyond the academy</i></p>
	<p><i>Creating, inspiring and supporting new forms of artistic, literary, linguistic, social, economic, religious and other expression beyond the academy.</i></p>
	<p><i>Preserving, conserving, and interpreting cultural heritage for audiences external to the academy</i></p>
	<p><i>Developing stimuli to tourism and contributing to the quality of the tourist experience</i></p>
ECONOMY	ECONOMIC PROSPERITY
<p>For example, impacts, benefits or effects on the management of resources of an area, business sector, community, country or countries</p>	<p>Applying and transferring the insights and knowledge gained from research to create wealth in the manufacturing, service, creative and cultural sectors.</p>
	<p><i>Contributing to innovation and entrepreneurial activity through the design and delivery of new products and services</i></p>
	<p><i>Contributing to economic prosperity via the creative sector including publishing, music, theatre, museums and galleries, film and television, fashion, tourism, and computer games</i></p>
	<p><i>Informing or influencing the development of expert systems in areas such as medicine, human resources, accounting and financial services</i></p>
	EDUCATION
	<p>Influencing the form or the content of the education of any group in any part of the world where they extend significantly beyond the submitting HEI</p>
	<p><i>Contributing to continuing personal and professional development</i></p>
	<p><i>Informing and influencing the design and delivery of curriculum and syllabi in schools, other HEIs or other educational institutions</i></p>
	<p><i>Influencing the methods, ideas and ethics of any profession</i></p>
ENVIRONMENT	
<p>For example, impacts, benefits or effects on the built and/or natural environments</p>	
HEALTH	
<p>For example, impacts, benefits or effects on the condition of the body or mind of individuals or groups</p>	



PUBLIC POLICY, LAW AND SERVICES	POLICY MAKING
<p>For example, impacts, benefits or effects on decisions, strategies and/or operations as decided or provided by authorities at a variety of levels.</p> <p>The main panel particularly acknowledges that there may be impacts or effects from Main Panel C disciplines which take forms such as holding public or private bodies to account or subjecting proposed changes in society, public policy, business practices and so on to public scrutiny. Such holding to account or public scrutiny may have had the effect of a proposed change not taking place, and this may of itself be claimed as impact or benefit. There may also be examples of research findings having been communicated to, but not necessarily acted upon, by the intended audience, but which nevertheless make a contribution to critical public debate.</p>	<p>Influencing policy debate and practice through informed interventions relating to any aspect of human or animal well-being or the environment</p>
	<p><i>Informing practice or policy as a result of research on the nature and extent of religious, ethnic or linguistic discrimination</i></p>
	<p><i>Providing expert advice to governments, NGOs, charities and the private sector in the UK and internationally and thereby influencing policy and/or practice</i></p>
	<p>PUBLIC DISCLOSURE</p>
	<p>Extending the range and improving the quality of evidence, argument and expression to enhance public understanding of the major issues and challenges faced by individuals and society</p>
	<p><i>Research into the languages and cultures of minority linguistic, ethnic, religious, immigrant, cultures and communities used by government, NGOs, charities or private sector to understand and respond to their needs</i></p>
	<p>PUBLIC SERVICES</p>
<p>Contributing to the development and delivering of public services or legislation to support the welfare, education, understanding or empowerment of diverse individuals and groups in society, including the disadvantaged or marginalised.</p>	
<p><i>Engaging with and mediating between NGOs and charities in the UK and internationally to influence their activities, for example in relation to health, education and the environment</i></p>	

More Information

HEFCE has published the draft panel criteria and working methods, from which the above information is extracted, here:

http://www.hefce.ac.uk/research/ref/pubs/2011/03_11/